

# **A Dozen of the Worst REDD-type Projects<sup>i</sup> Affecting Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities**



**CARBON  
TRADE  
WATCH**

## **LATIN AMERICA**

**1. Chevron uses armed guards for a REDD-type project in Brazil.** The Nature Conservancy, General Motors, American Electric Power, Society for Wildlife Research and Environmental Education, and Chevron (previously known as Texaco), infamous for destruction caused in Ecuadorian Amazon, have implemented the Guaraqueçaba Climate Action Project in **the ancestral territory of Guarani People** with uniformed armed guards called “Força Verde” or “Green Force” who **intimidate and persecute local communities; jailing and shooting at people who go into the forest as well as forcibly entering and searching private homes without due authorization** <sup>ii</sup> “[T]he project has caused **devastating impacts** on the local communities...”<sup>iii</sup>

**2. An Indigenous leader was criminalized for defending his people and territory from an Australian carbon cowboy who duped the Matsés People of the Peruvian Amazon into signing a REDD-type contract** for perpetuity and written in English, which grants the carbon trader **total control over the Matsés People’s land, way of life, intellectual property, forests and carbon**. The contract also stipulates that **anyone who denounces this scam will be sued**.<sup>iv</sup> The carbon trader has brought charges against Indigenous Matsés Leader Daniel Jimenez. National and international Indigenous Peoples’ Organizations, AIDESEP (National Organization of the Amazonian Indigenous Peoples of Peru) and COICA (Coordinating Body of Indigenous Organizations of the Amazon Basin), demanded the expulsion of the carbon trader from Peru.<sup>v</sup> The carbon trader has censored and attacked the freedom of expression and freedom of press of a journalist who covered the story for REDD Monitor.<sup>vi</sup>

**3. Indigenous Peoples in Voluntary Isolation are threatened by REDD-type plantation projects related to the Inter-Oceanic Highway and logging concessions to be implemented near their territories in the Peruvian Amazon.** Indigenous Peoples in Voluntary Isolation avoid contact with other people and societies and live in remote regions. They are highly vulnerable for a number of reasons including their lack of defenses against common diseases. **Contact with others such as REDD-type project implementers in the Madre de Dios region of the Peruvian Amazon could be disastrous for the Yora People and the Amahuaca People who live in voluntary isolation.**<sup>vii</sup>

**4. In Bolivia, BP, whose oil spill in the Gulf of Mexico was the biggest environmental disaster in the history of the United States, participates in the biggest REDD-type project in the world in the Chiquitano People’s territory,** which helps it to greenwash its destruction of biodiversity and communities’ livelihoods.<sup>viii</sup> Yet another example of extractive industries like Dow, Rio Tinto, Shell, Statoil, American Electric Power-AEP and BHP Billiton which have historically caused pollution and deforestation and are promoting REDD as a profitable opportunity to “offset” their ongoing pillaging of the planet. As noted in the *New York Times*, “...programs to pay for forest preservation could merely serve as a cash cow for the very people who are destroying them.”<sup>ix</sup>

**5. In numerous places in the world, REDD-type projects and policies are being implemented in violation of the right of Free, Prior and Informed Consent (FPIC).** In Ecuador, the government continues to develop a REDD program despite the fact that the most representative organization of Indigenous Peoples, the **Confederation of Indigenous Nationalities of Ecuador, (CONAIE), has explicitly rejected the implementation of all REDD+ policies and projects in the country.**<sup>x</sup>

## **AFRICA**

**6. Despite Amnesty International’s recommendation to “stop immediately the practice of forced evictions,”<sup>xi</sup> as Kenya’s Mau Forest is made “ready” for a UNEP-funded REDD+ project, members of the Ogiek People continue to suffer violent evictions, and Ogiek activists are attacked for protesting land grabs.**<sup>xii</sup> Minority Rights Group International includes the Ogiek People in their list of “Peoples Under Threat” from genocide, mass killings or violent repression<sup>xiii</sup> and this latest wave of evictions **could threaten the cultural survival of the Ogiek People.**

**7. According to “The DRC Case Study: The impacts of carbon sinks of Ibi-Batéké Project on the Indigenous Pygmies of the Democratic Republic of Congo” published by the International Alliance of Indigenous and Tribal Peoples of the Tropical Forests, Batwa Pygmies suffer “servitude”<sup>xiv</sup> on the World Bank Ibi-Batéké Carbon Sink Plantation.**<sup>xv</sup> An employee of the project says “this must not be understood...as if it were slavery.”<sup>xvi</sup> This **REDD-type forest carbon plantation for fuel wood and charcoal** is the DRC’s first Clean Development Project and claims to contribute to sustainable



development and climate change mitigation.<sup>xvii</sup> However, Pygmy leaders have repeatedly denounced the World Bank for funding deforestation of their ancestral forests which not only releases emissions but also violates their rights, leads to the destruction of their livelihood and causes social conflict.<sup>xviii</sup> Furthermore, according to "Advance Guard" published by the United Nations University,<sup>xix</sup> "Indigenous Peoples' rights, experiences, and cultural and spiritual traditions are being ignored. Nothing to ensure the Pygmy's preliminary consent, which was mandated within the framework of the project, has been done since consultation began."

8..Over **22,000 people were violently evicted** from the Mubende and Kiboga districts in Uganda to make way for the UK-based New Forests Company to plant trees, **to earn carbon credits** and ultimately to sell the timber.<sup>xx</sup> According to *The New York Times*, "**New Forests Company (NFC)**, grows forests in African countries with the purpose of **selling credits from the carbon dioxide its trees soak up to polluters abroad**."<sup>xxi</sup> *The New York Times* also reports "...[V]illagers described **gun-toting soldiers and an 8-year-old child burning to death when his home was set ablaze** by security officers."<sup>xxii</sup> New Forests Company is 20% owned by the HSBC bank and investors in the project include the World Bank. **Evicted successful farmers are reduced to becoming poorly paid plantation peons on the land they were evicted from**. "Homeless and hopeless, Mr. Tushabe said he took a job with the company that pushed him out. He was promised more than \$100 each month, he said, but received only about \$30."<sup>xxiii</sup> NFC has been certified under the Forest Stewardship Council since 2009.<sup>xxiv</sup>

## ASIA

9..Two of the biggest greenhouse polluters on the planet oil giants, Gazprom and Shell, infamous for the genocide of the Ogoni People and environmental destruction in Nigeria's Niger Delta, **bankroll the Rimba Raya REDD project** in Central Kalimantan, Indonesia.<sup>xxv</sup> The project is also supported by the Clinton Foundation and approved by the Voluntary Carbon Standard (VSC) and Climate, Community and Biodiversity Alliance (CCBA). Nnimmo Bassey, the Director of Environmental Rights Action (FoE Nigeria) and Chair of Friends of the Earth International, says, "We have suffered Shell's destruction of communities and biodiversity as well as oil spills and gas flaring for decades. **Now we can add financing REDD for greenwash and profits to the long list of Shell's atrocities**."<sup>xxvi</sup>

10..Carbon Conservation has been granted exclusive rights to sell and market carbon credits from **the Ulu Masen REDD project** which covers an area of 770,000 hectares in Aceh province in the north of Sumatra.<sup>xxvii</sup> However, a Canadian mining company called East Asia Minerals Corporation, will buy 50% of Carbon Conservation Pty Ltd.<sup>xxviii</sup> Carbon Conservation may then use the Ulu Masen project to **greenwash** East Asia Minerals' nearby **mining**,<sup>xxix</sup> generate huge carbon finance profits<sup>xxx</sup> without really reducing deforestation<sup>xxxi</sup> and **use "1,000 heavily-armed" guards**.<sup>xxxii</sup> According to REDD Monitor, "The deal between Carbon Conservation and East Asia Minerals reveals the **sordid underbelly of REDD**. East Asia Minerals gets to **paint its mining operations green**. Carbon Conservation gets to keep its **bankers happy**. Meanwhile Flora and Fauna International helps produce **carbon credits from Ulu Masen that will be sold to polluting companies, ensuring that pollution elsewhere continues**."<sup>xxxiii</sup>

## OCEANIA

11. Papua New Guinea, "carbon cowboys" are running amok, conning and coercing communities into signing away their land rights with **fake contracts**.<sup>xxxiv</sup> The land and power of attorney of 45,000 indigenous in East Pangia was handed over to a carbon trader.<sup>xxxv</sup> "Carbon finance and REDD have triggered a 'gold rush' mentality."<sup>xxxvi</sup> Scandals, scams and fraud abound.<sup>xxxvii</sup>



## STATE TO STATE: California, USA and Chiapas, Mexico

12..The State of California is promoting subnational carbon market REDD in Chiapas, Mexico, Acre, Brazil, Aceh, Indonesia and Cross River, Nigeria.<sup>xxxviii</sup> **In Chiapas, Mexico, Tzeltal People** of the community of Amador Hernandez **denounce the California REDD project as a climate mask "to cover up the dispossession of the biodiversity of the peoples."**<sup>xxxix</sup> The community has denounced what they perceived as a **land grab**. A year before, the villagers said, **all government medical services, including vaccinations, had been cut off**; several **elderly people and children died** due to lack of medical attention. This neglect, they believed, was due to their refusal to capitulate to the demands of REDD. "They're attacking our health as a way of getting access to our land," Martinez said.<sup>xl</sup> The community has asked the governor of Chiapas to "suspend the state REDD+ project in the Lacandon Community Zone, as it constitutes a **counterinsurgency plan** that promotes conflicts between neighboring communities."<sup>xli</sup>

1..REDD-type projects are not necessarily official REDD projects but they are relevant to understanding potential impacts of REDD insofar as they involve forest carbon credits.

ALL OTHER FOOTNOTES ARE POSTED ON [WWW.NOREDD.MAKENOISE.ORG](http://WWW.NOREDD.MAKENOISE.ORG) Graphic: Santiago Argmengod [www.justseeds.org](http://www.justseeds.org)

<sup>i</sup> REDD-type projects are not necessarily official REDD projects but they are relevant to understanding potential impacts of REDD insofar as they involve forest carbon credits.  
ALL OTHER FOOTNOTES ARE POSTED ON [WWW.NOREDD.MAKENOISE.ORG](http://WWW.NOREDD.MAKENOISE.ORG) Graphic: Santiago Argmengod [www.justseeds.org](http://www.justseeds.org)

<sup>ii</sup> PBS/Frontline World, Carbon Watch, Centre for Investigative Journalism  
<http://www.pbs.org/frontlineworld/stories/carbonwatch/moneytree/> REDD Monitor, *Injustice on the carbon frontier in Guaraqueçaba, Brazil* <http://www.redd-monitor.org/2009/11/06/injustice-on-the-carbon-frontier-in-guaraquecaba-brazil/> Mother Jones, *GM's Money Trees* <http://motherjones.com/environment/2009/11/gms-money-trees>  
National Museum of the American Indian, Smithsonian Institute, Washington, DC, Fall 2011  
*Conversations with the Earth*,  
[http://www.conversationsearth.org/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=35&Itemid=5&88c60d09cbeb0c0f5ab56c802eeadb5c=d2fc690bda16802103d60a27ea8bed21](http://www.conversationsearth.org/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=35&Itemid=5&88c60d09cbeb0c0f5ab56c802eeadb5c=d2fc690bda16802103d60a27ea8bed21)

<sup>iii</sup> World Rainforest Movement, *Forest carbon project in Paraná, Brazil: Reduction of deforestation and persecution of local communities* <http://wrm.org.uy/>

<sup>iv</sup> AIDESEP (National Organization of the Amazonian Indigenous Peoples of Peru), Declaración de Iquitos <http://www.aidesep.org.pe/index.php?codnota=2000>

<sup>v</sup> REDD Papers – Volume I, (2011) *Colonizing territories with REDD: An Australian “Carbon Cowboy” and the Matsés People in the Peruvian Amazon*; REDD Monitor, *AIDESEP and COICA condemn and reject “carbon cowboy” and demand his expulsion from Peru*, [www.redd-monitor.org/2011/05/03/aidesep-and-coica-condemn-and-reject-carbon-cowboy-censored-and-demand-his-expulsion-from-peru](http://www.redd-monitor.org/2011/05/03/aidesep-and-coica-condemn-and-reject-carbon-cowboy-censored-and-demand-his-expulsion-from-peru)

<sup>vi</sup> REDD Monitor (2011) *A “carbon cowboy”, internet censorship and REDD-Monitor* <http://www.redd-monitor.org/2011/08/10/a-carbon-cowboy-internet-censorship-and-redd-monitor/> *“Carbon cowboy” [CENSORED] denounces indigenous chief in Peru* <http://www.redd-monitor.org/2011/08/05/carbon-cowboy-censored-denounces-indigenous-chief-in-peru/>

<sup>vii</sup> NO REDD – A Reader, *Enclosure of forests and peoples: REDD and the Inter-Oceanic Highway in Peru* (2010) <http://noredm.makenoise.org/wp-content/uploads/2010/REDDreaderEN.pdf>

<sup>viii</sup> Cardona, T. et. al. (2010) *Extractive Industries and REDD, No REDD A Reader*.

<sup>ix</sup> The New York Times, Elisabeth Rosenthal (2009), *“In Brazil, Paying Farmers to Let the Trees Stand”*, 21 August 2009.

<sup>x</sup> CONAIE, Open Letter to UN Secretary General Ban Ki-moon demanding cancelation of all REDD projects, REDD Papers – Volume I, Original in Spanish  
[http://www.movimientos.org/enlacei/show\\_text.php3?key=19549](http://www.movimientos.org/enlacei/show_text.php3?key=19549)

<sup>xi</sup> Amnesty International: *Kenya: Nowhere to Go: Forced Evictions in Mau Forest* “Incidents of forced evictions have been reported in different areas of the Mau Forest since 2004, affecting thousands of families.” <http://www.amnesty.org/fr/library/info/AFR32/006/2007> p.1-2

<sup>xii</sup> See: International Working Group on Indigenous Affairs (2011), *Kenya’s ‘Forest People’ in Bitter Fight for their Ancestral Homes*, April 15 2011.

Minority Rights Group International (2011), *Minority Rights Group Condemns Targeted Attacks on Ogik Activists*, March 7, 2011.

First Peoples International (2011), *In new Kenya, old guard ‘land-grabbers’ attack key leaders -Ogik land activists survive assaults*.

Interim Coordinating Secretariat, Office of the Prime Minister on behalf of the Government of Kenya, *Rehabilitation of the Mau Forest Ecosystem*.

Los Angeles Times (2010), *Kenyan tribe slowly driven off its ancestral lands*.

Survival International (2010), *Kenyan tribe’s houses torched in Mau Forest eviction* 8 April 2010.

REDD Monitor (2009), *Ogik threatened with eviction from Mau Forest*.

<sup>xiii</sup> The Standard <http://www.standardmedia.co.ke/InsidePage.php?id=1144018627&catid=16&a=1>

<sup>xiv</sup> International Alliance of Indigenous and Tribal Peoples of the Tropical Forests, “Indigenous Peoples and Climate Change: Vulnerabilities, Adaptation, and Responses to Mechanisms of the Kyoto Protocol,” (2007) Makelo, S., “The DRC Case Study: the impacts of carbon sinks of Ibi-Batéké Project on the indigenous Pygmies of the Democratic Republic of Congo” p.45-74 especially 62-64 <http://www.international-alliance.org/documents/Climate%20Change%20-%20DRC.pdf> The human rights violations against Pygmies are grave throughout the country. See “Pygmies beg UN for aid to save them from Congo cannibals” <http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/world/article1135111.ece>

---

<sup>xv</sup> World Bank “DRC Ibi Bateke Carbon Sink Plantation”

<http://wbcarbonfinance.org/Router.cfm?Page=Projport&ProjID=43647> World Bank documents claim no Indigenous Peoples affected on pages 4 and 8 [http://www-wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSPContentServer/WDSP/IB/2009/06/04/000333037\\_20090604015605/Original/487470ISDS0rev1i0Bateke0Box338924B0.doc](http://www-wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSPContentServer/WDSP/IB/2009/06/04/000333037_20090604015605/Original/487470ISDS0rev1i0Bateke0Box338924B0.doc) Four million dollar investment from World Bank Carbon Finance:

<http://web.worldbank.org/external/projects/main?Projectid=P096414&Type=Financial&theSitePK=40941&pagePK=64330670&menuPK=64282135&piPK=64302772> Forest Carbon Inventory Project [http://www.forestcarbonportal.com/inventory\\_project.php?item=294](http://www.forestcarbonportal.com/inventory_project.php?item=294)

<sup>xvi</sup> International Alliance of Indigenous and Tribal Peoples of the Tropical Forests, “Indigenous Peoples and Climate Change: Vulnerabilities, Adaptation, and Responses to Mechanisms of the Kyoto Protocol,” (2007) Makelo, S., “The DRC Case Study: the impacts of carbon sinks of Ibi-Batéké Project on the indigenous Pygmies of the Democratic Republic of Congo” p.64 <http://www.international-alliance.org/documents/Climate%20Change%20-%20DRC.pdf>

<sup>xvii</sup> Reuters: World Bank to buy carbon credit from Congo Project

<http://www.reuters.com/article/environmentNews/idUSTRE57409I20090805>

<sup>xviii</sup> World Bank Inspection Panel - Request for Inspection from Pygmy Organization for harm caused by World Bank funding to forestry sector in DRC

[http://www.rainforestfoundationuk.org/files/Congo\\_CDR\\_NoR.pdf](http://www.rainforestfoundationuk.org/files/Congo_CDR_NoR.pdf)

<sup>xix</sup> McLean, Kristy Gallowy, “Advance Guard, Climate Change Impacts, Adaptation, Mitigation and Indigenous Peoples”, p.45

[http://www.unutki.org/downloads/File/Publications/UNU\\_Advance\\_Guard\\_Compendium\\_2010\\_final\\_web.pdf](http://www.unutki.org/downloads/File/Publications/UNU_Advance_Guard_Compendium_2010_final_web.pdf)

<sup>xx</sup> The Guardian, (2011) *Ugandan farmer: 'My land gave me everything. Now I'm one of the poorest'* <http://www.guardian.co.uk/environment/2011/sep/22/uganda-farmer-land-gave-me-everything> The Wall Street Journal, (2011) *African Land Acquisitions Comes Under Scrutiny* <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424053111904563904576584673419328758.html>

<sup>xxi</sup> New York Times, (2011) *In Uganda, Losing Land to Planted Trees* – Slide Show

<http://www.nytimes.com/slideshow/2011/09/22/world/africa/22uganda-3.html>

<sup>xxii</sup> New York Times, *In Scramble for Land, Group Says, Company Pushed Ugandans Out*

[http://www.nytimes.com/2011/09/22/world/africa/in-scramble-for-land-oxfam-says-ugandans-were-pushed-out.html?\\_r=1](http://www.nytimes.com/2011/09/22/world/africa/in-scramble-for-land-oxfam-says-ugandans-were-pushed-out.html?_r=1)

<sup>xxiii</sup> Ibid.

<sup>xxiv</sup> REDD Monitor, Ugandan farmers kicked off their land for New Forests Company's carbon project <http://www.redd-monitor.org/2011/09/23/ugandan-farmers-kicked-off-their-land-for-new-forests-companys-carbon-project/#more-9681>

<sup>xxv</sup> REDD Monitor, (2010) *Shell REDD project slammed by Indigenous Environmental Network and Friends of the Earth Nigeria* <http://www.redd-monitor.org/2010/09/08/indigenous-environmental-network-and-friends-of-the-earth-nigeria-denounce-shell-redd-project/>

<sup>xxvi</sup> Ibid.

<sup>xxvii</sup> Greenomics Indonesia Press Release: *Aceh's Forests Greasing Works of Australian Carbon Company's Share Dealings* (2011) [http://www.redd-monitor.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2011/05/11-05-04\\_Greenomics.pdf](http://www.redd-monitor.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2011/05/11-05-04_Greenomics.pdf)

<sup>xxviii</sup> REDD Monitor, *Mining company to buy 50% of Carbon Conservation* <http://www.redd-monitor.org/2011/05/05/mining-company-to-buy-50-of-carbon-conservation-will-redd-help-greenwash-mining/#more-8295>

<sup>xxix</sup> EAS Project Areas map “The map is taken from [this East Asia Minerals presentation about the Miwah project](#) (pdf file, 7 MB).” <http://www.redd-monitor.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2011/05/eas-aceh.png>

<sup>xxx</sup> “The company, Carbon Conservation, has persuaded Wall St banker Merrill Lynch to sink \$9 million into local businesses in Aceh. The deal could be worth \$400 million in carbon credits for the bank.” ABC Rural, *Carbon scheme will help save Aceh forest* <http://www.abc.net.au/rural/news/content/200804/s2214030.htm>

<sup>xxxi</sup> “Recent research suggests that the Ulu Masen project will do little to reduce deforestation.” REDD Monitor, *Interviews about Ulu Masen, Indonesia: A REDD-labelled Protected Area* <http://www.redd-monitor.org/2010/01/20/interviews-about-ulu-masen-indonesia-a-redd-labelled-protected-area/> Environmental Research Letters *The future of forests and orangutans in Sumatra* <http://iopscience.iop.org/1748-9326/4/3/034013/fulltext>

<sup>xxxii</sup> ABC Rural, *Carbon scheme will help save Aceh forest*

<http://www.abc.net.au/rural/news/content/200804/s2214030.htm>



- 
- xxxiii REDD Monitor, *Mining company to buy 50% of Carbon Conservation* <http://www.redd-monitor.org/2011/05/05/mining-company-to-buy-50-of-carbon-conservation-will-redd-help-greenwash-mining/#more-8295>
- xxxiv Gridneff, I. (2011), *Carbon conmen selling the sky*, The Sydney Morning Herald.
- xxxv Watch VIDEO: "A Breath of Fresh Air" by Jeremy Dawes, <http://www.redd-monitor.org/2009/09/11/more-questions-than-answers-on-carbon-trading-in-png/>
- xxxvi Sydney Morning Herald, <http://www.smh.com.au/environment/australian-firm-linked-to-pngs-100m-carbon-trading-scandal-20090903-fa2y.html>
- xxxvii REDD Monitor, *REDD Projects in Papua New Guinea "Legally untenable"* <http://www.redd-monitor.org/2010/09/14/redd-projects-in-papua-new-guinea-legally-untenable/>
- xxxviii REDD Monitor, *Just what REDD Needed. Carbon Offsets and another Abbreviation. Welcome R-20* <http://www.redd-monitor.org/2010/11/19/just-what-redd-needed-carbon-offsets-and-another-abbreviation-welcome-to-r20/#more-6500>
- xxxix REDD Monitor (2011) *Statement from Chiapas, Mexico: REDD project is a climate mask "to cover up the dispossession of the biodiversity of the peoples"* <http://www.redd-monitor.org/2011/09/07/statement-from-chiapas-mexico-redd-project-is-a-climate-mask-to-cover-up-the-dispossession-of-the-biodiversity-of-the-peoples/>
- xl REDD Monitor (2011) *Statement from Chiapas, Mexico: REDD project is a climate mask "to cover up the dispossession of the biodiversity of the peoples"* <http://www.redd-monitor.org/2011/09/07/statement-from-chiapas-mexico-redd-project-is-a-climate-mask-to-cover-up-the-dispossession-of-the-biodiversity-of-the-peoples/>
- xli Climate Connections, (2011), *Environmental, Indigenous Peoples and Human Rights Groups Reject International Offsets in California's Global Warming Solutions Act* <http://climate-connections.org/2011/08/23/environmental-indigenous-peoples-and-human-rights-groups-reject-international-offsets-in-californias-global-warming-solutions-act/>